



**Performance of the  
Senate on Education  
Standing Committee of the**  
(May 2004 - September 2005)

## I. Introduction

Parliamentary committees constitute an integral and indispensable part of legislative systems. In established democracies, parliamentary committees play an extremely important role in law-making and legislative oversight of the executive branch. In many legislative systems, most of the business is actually handled by the parliamentary committees. Legislative bills and other important issues, which warrant in depth consideration, are often referred to the parliamentary committees. In many countries, parliamentary committees are also authorized to take a range of initiatives to perform parliamentary oversight vis-à-vis government departments and ministries.

In Pakistan too, the Parliament has constituted a large number committees to perform specific roles. Senate of Pakistan alone has established 26 committees, which include 21 standing committees and 3 functional committees (i.e. Committee on Government Assurances; Committee on Problems of Less Developed Areas; and Committee on Human Rights). Other 2 committees are (1) the Committee on Rules of Procedure and Privileges and (2) the House Committee. Each standing committee deals with the business of the Government relating to the Ministry or Divisions with which it is concerned or any other matter referred to it by the Senate.

One of the 21 standing committees is on Education (Education and Scientific and Technological Research). Its role is extremely critical in view of the fact that there exist serious challenges in the context of public sector education system, which need to be effectively addressed achieve the goals of universal literacy and producing highly skilled workforce to meet our national requirements. Furthermore, it may be noted that this Committee is concerned with the ministry of education, which is one of the largest in the Federal Government.

Against the above background, Centre for Peace and Development Initiatives, Pakistan (CPDI-Pakistan) has prepared this report on the Standing Committee of the Senate on Education to promote the following objectives:

- To identify gaps and weaknesses in the performance of the Committee and share them with members of the Committee, other parliamentarians and leadership of political parties to inform their political agenda and strategies for stronger and more effective parliamentary performance in the education sector;
- To inform advocacy initiatives of civil society groups working in the education sector, and facilitate them for establishing constructive and effective engagements with the Committee; and
- To create public awareness about the role, responsibility and performance of parliamentary institutions on critical national challenges like education; and hence inform their political choices.

This report is based on the data and information, which CPDI-Pakistan could collect from diverse sources. In the absence of any policy by the Committee or Senate Secretariat to share such information with citizens and civil society groups, it was not easy to prepare this report. It is, therefore, possible

that it misses out some information on the performance of the Committee, which should be blamed on the culture of secrecy that mars the functioning of parliamentary committees and secretariat. We shall, however, welcome any feedback or additional information shared with us to inform our future work in this area.

## II. Performance of the Senate Standing Committee on Education

### 1. Meetings of the Committee

1.1. It appears from the data available to CPDI-Pakistan that the Senate Standing Committee on Education as well as its sub-committees had held 21 meetings between May 18, 2004 and September 5, 2005. This means that the Committee held more than one meeting per month, which may be taken as indicative of Committee's commitment to actively perform its responsibilities. This view can be supported by the very good attendance record of members in the committee meetings (i.e. 8-9 members per meeting); although some cynics may attribute it to the members' interest in pocketing as much per diem as possible. It may be noted that Committee consists of 12 members; while the quorum requirement for the Committee's meeting is only 3 members.

1.2. All of the 21 Committee meetings were held in Islamabad except 2, which were organized in Lahore. One of these exceptions was the meeting of the Sub-Committee on Science and Technology, held on 7<sup>th</sup> April 2005 at the residence of Senator Dr. Nighat Agha, to study various aspects of the issue of establishment of new universities in the public/private sectors. Second was the meeting of the Committee, also held on 7<sup>th</sup> April 2005, to take briefings from provincial officials on the education-related initiatives and departments in Punjab.

Table 1: Members of the Standing Committee on Education

Ms. Razina Alam Khan (Chairperson Committee)	Dr. Muhammad Said (Member)
Molvi Agha Muhammad (Member)	Ms. Nighat Mirza (Advocate) (Member)
Prof. Muhammad Saeed Siddiqui (Member)	Mr. Roshan Khursheed Bharucha (Member)
Mr. Sajid Mir (Member)	Ms. Tahira Latif (Member)
Dr. Nighat Agha (Member)	Prof. Muhammad Ibrahim Khan (Member)
Mr. S. M. Zafar (Member)	Ms. Tanveer Khalid (Member)

### 2. Issues Taken up by the Committee

Between May 18, 2004 and September 5, 2005, the Committee took up some important education-related issues, received briefings on them from the related departments/ ministries, and made recommendations. Among others, the issues taken up included the following:

1. Problems/ controversies related to curriculum/ syllabus;
2. Criteria for opening of private universities; and
3. Higher education / scientific education and research.

It is, however, not clear whether the Committee could make any significant contribution on these issues by providing competent guidance for improvement in relevant policies and ensuring their efficient monitoring and implementation. It would be useful if the Committee could hold one special meeting to discuss whether it has been able to make any tangible impact; and how best it can play more effective role.

### **3. Performance Deficit**

3.1. The Committee spent most of its time on receiving briefings from different education-related departments/ ministries of the Federal Government. There were very few instances, if at all, where it could proactively identify issues/ problems and make specific recommendations to effectively deal with them. Recommendations made by the Committee were mostly of a very general nature. In order to make precise and competent recommendations and play more effective legislative oversight role, the Committee needed to look deeper into the functioning of the Ministry/ departments and their performance vis-à-vis targets established under the education policy.

3.2. Almost all recommendations made by the Committee were based on the briefings and data provided by various departments under the Ministry of Education, Higher Education Commission (HEC) or by the departments related the Ministry of Science and Technology. It seems that the Committee made no effort to collect views and information from other stakeholders like parents, teachers' associations, students, civil society groups or independent experts. Only exception was the case of Committee's investigation into the criteria notified by HEC for private universities. In this case, members of the Committee apparently visited some private universities and collected their feedback on the subject. But here too, only two stakeholders (i.e. HEC and management of private universities) were consulted; while views of parents, students, independent experts or civil society groups were not solicited. This style of working involves significant risks and may result in recommendations, which are lopsided, unbalanced and uninformed of the full range of possible implications. (This report does not attempt to examine the quality of various recommendations of the Committee but it is hoped that, in follow up to this modest contribution, such a task would be carried out by independent experts and relevant civil society organizations.)

3.3. All meetings of the Committee were held in camera, and members of the public or media were not allowed to observe its proceedings. Under the Rules, the Committee can decide to hold its meetings in the open but no such initiative was taken by the Committee. It may be noted that some parliamentary committees (e.g. Senate Committee on Human Rights under the chairmanship of Mr. S. M. Zafar) have been holding their meetings in the open. By organizing its meetings in open, the Committee can demonstrate its commitment to transparency and, thereby, contribute to development of conditions wherein people take interest in Committee's proceedings, make useful inputs and support its good initiatives.

3.4. The Committee did not hold any public hearing to listen to the problems, concerns or views of independent experts, stakeholders or civil society experts. Considering that organization of public

hearings is widely recognized as a good parliamentary practice, the Committee should have taken such initiatives to address problems faced by the public and perform its role in holding departments of education to account. This would have made the departments of education more responsive; besides building the credibility of the Committee and democratic accountability in the public perception.

3.5. The Committee took little interest in examining the use of funds, which are allocated to the ministry, attached departments or related autonomous institutions in the annual budget. As a result, the Committee's role in scrutinizing the use of past year's allocations against specific targets or developing next year's budget is virtually negligible. This is a matter of serious concern in view of the fact that Senate gets a very little time to discuss the annual budget and formulate its recommendations for the National Assembly during the Budget Session. Realizing this, one would have expected the Senate Committee to actively look into the budget-related issues and concerns, so that it could not only check inefficiencies during the year but also ensure that its members will be able to make more effective contribution to the Senate proceedings during the Budget Session.

3.6. In recognition of widespread incidence of corruption<sup>1</sup> and inefficiencies across government departments, the Committee could have proactively worked to ensure that the ministry and related departments implement effective measures to establish transparent procedures, strong monitoring systems and effective anti-corruption mechanisms. The Committee, however, failed to take any significant initiative to identify lacunae resulting in corrupt or inefficient practices and then make competent recommendations.

3.7. It appears from the data that no Bill was forwarded by the House to the Committee for consideration during the period under discussion in this report. Similarly, it appears that the Committee felt no need of recommending new legislation or introducing amendments in existing laws governing the education sector in Pakistan. As a general rule, however, one would expect that the Committee would make such recommendations to the concerned ministries or the House if members feel such a need, as determined in consultation with various stakeholders. Considering that most laws relating to different sectors are outdated and need reconsideration, it is hard to believe that no such need exists in the case of education sector. On this matter, the Committee should be able to develop an informed opinion by proactively soliciting suggestions from government departments as well as civil society groups.

3.8. The Committee made a large number of recommendations including about increased allocations for certain programmes or departments. It is, however, not known whether any of them was fully implemented. It seems that the Committee has no mechanism in place to monitor compliance with its recommendations.

3.9. It is not clear from the data that the Committee submitted any report to the House about its performance or on the specific issues that it considered. There may be good reasons for this but ordinarily, one would expect that the Committee would report to the House on serious issues or problems concerning the education sector, as identified in the course of its oversight functions.

---

<sup>1</sup> In 2005, Pakistan ranked at 144<sup>th</sup> out of the total 158 countries surveyed for the Transparency International's Corruption Perception Index. It is a fact that corruption is one of the most serious challenges confronting Pakistan; and the education sector is no exception to it.

3.10. The Committee does not publicize the schedule and agenda of its meetings. It does not have its own website; nor does it post any information about its meetings, agenda, minutes of the meeting or recommendations on the website of the Senate. As a result, citizens and civil society groups find it difficult to share information, research or views with the Committee on issues that it takes up in its regular meetings.

3.11. The Committee does not publish any annual report on its performance. It is, therefore, hard for citizens and civil society groups to find out about the initiatives of the Committee and whether they were successful. The Committee would set a good example if starts publishing annual reports, which provide information about (a) issues taken up; (b) stakeholders consulted; (c) public hearings organized; (d) recommendations made; (e) how many of its recommendations were implemented; and (f) actions it took on recommendations that were not implemented by the concerned ministries/ departments. The annual report must also include information about the funds that were consumed by the Committee in the course of performing its responsibilities.

### **III. Conclusions and Recommendations**

It is widely recognized that the Committee system in Pakistan is weak, and has been unable to deliver on the expectations associated with it in functional democracies. While a comprehensive understanding about the causes for this weak performance requires a thorough investigation, there seems to be a general consensus on the following:

- Frequent disruptions in the democratic process have not allowed the committees to evolve into effective parliamentary institutions;
- Committees lack research and administrative support to carry out their functions more effectively; and
- Citizens and civil society groups are generally unaware about the functions of parliamentary committees and, therefore, do not watch their performance to support their good initiatives, identify weaknesses and demand more effective performance. In this environment of apparently weak demand for improved committee performance, the members lack motivation or political incentives to demonstrate performance.

Against this background, it is recommended that:

- The Committee must publicize its meetings and agendas in advance, hold its meetings in the open, and organize public hearings on critical issues relating to the education sector;
- The Committee must take initiatives to ensure that adequate funds are allocated in the next budget to provide for research and administrative support to the Committee;
- The Committee must proactively establish contacts with civil society organizations working in the education sector with the aim of benefiting from their experiences, research, databases and expertise. This would enable the Committee to more effectively cross-examine

government ministries/ departments on the basis of information obtained from diverse sources; and not just on the basis of selectively provided information by official sources;

- Civil society groups working in the education sector must also proactively engage the parliamentary committees on education. This would help them in advancing their advocacy objectives vis-à-vis the education sector. At the same time, this would enable committees to perform their functions more effectively;
- The Committee must take concrete steps to improve its performance in the light of these recommendations and weaknesses identified in the above section. This would help in building the confidence of citizens and civil society groups in the Committee; and would be a significant step forward towards democratic accountability.

## Appendix I

**Meetings of the Senate Standing Committee on Education**

No	Meeting	Agenda Items	Issues Discussed and Decisions Taken/ Recommendations Made
1	Meeting of the Standing Committee on Education (Education and Scientific and Technological Research) was held on 18 <sup>th</sup> May 2004 in Committee Room No. 4, Parliament House, Islamabad under the Chairpersonship of Senator Mrs. Razina Alam Khan.	<p>1. Briefing on the organizational structural of Min. of Education and its attached departments, and</p> <p>2. Current issue regarding the curriculum/ syllabus, and</p> <p>3. Any other item with permission of the Chair.</p>	<p>Following recommendations were made by the Committee:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Funds may be increased for further strengthening Libraries;</li> <li>2. Arrangements may be made to purchase a sufficient number of books for libraries on various subjects,</li> <li>3. All vacant posts in the Ministry and its attached Departments may be filled up on merit and quota basis so that the work relating to different wings of the Ministry may not suffer.</li> <li>4. Arrangements may also be made to shift the National Library in Public place if possible. The timings of the Libraries may be divided into two shifts.</li> <li>5. A four member sub-committee will be constituted to investigate the recent issues of curriculum/syllabus.</li> <li>6. The Committee may continue to pay surprise visits in the Universities/ Colleges to inspect the working/ performance of the staff etc.</li> <li>7. The names of our Holy Prophet Hazrat Muhammad (Peace be upon him), Ahle-bait and companions of the Holy Prophet (Peace be upon him) may be written in the text books and other publications giving their full title according to the Islamic injunctions.</li> <li>8. Schools may be opened in the rural areas so that the poor people could be facilitated from education.</li> <li>9. The Technical schools for Women may be opened/ increased to solve the problem of technical literacy for women in order to alleviate poverty.</li> </ol>
2	Meeting of the Standing Committee on Science and Technological Research (Education, Science and Technological Research) was held on 3 <sup>rd</sup> June 2004 in Committee Room No.1, Parliament House, Islamabad, under the Chairpersonship of Senator Razina Alam Khan.	<p>Agenda before the Committee was as under:-</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Briefing on organizational structures of the Ministry of Science and Technology and its attached Department; and</li> <li>2. Any other item with permission of the Chair.</li> </ol>	<p>Following recommendations were made by the Committee:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. The Committee stressed the need for developing a national strategy for quality assurance and increase in productivity.</li> <li>2. The Committee also urged upon the need to improve scientific and technological education in the country.</li> <li>3. On a point raised by the Committee about budget allocations, the Adviser informed the Committee that this Ministry was allocated Rs.7.00 billion during 2002-03 which was reduced to 1.3 billion last year. However during the upcoming budget the Ministry was likely to be allocated Rs. 1.7 billion.</li> <li>4. On a question raised by the Committee about the funds, it was recommended that the Government should allocate more funds for building the base and strengthen institutions dedicated to scientific</li> </ol>

			<p>research with a view to achieving the desired national objectives.</p> <p>5. On a point raised by the Committee about the number of Scientific Institutions, it was recommended that the number of Institutes may be increased in the country so that the people of Pakistan could get scientific education.</p> <p>6. On a point raised by the Committee about the number of Scientific Institutions, it was recommended that the number of Institutes may be increased in the country so that the people of Pakistan could get scientific education.</p> <p>7. On a point raised by the Committee about the shortage of scientific equipment in the Institutions/Universities, it was recommended that necessary equipment should be provided to the Institutions/Universities in Pakistan.</p> <p>8. It was unanimously decided that the Committee would visit the Pakistan Scientific Laboratories and other Institutions in the country to evaluate its performance/working in consultation with the Ministry concerned.</p>
3	<p>Meeting of the Standing Committee on Education and Scientific and Technological Research was held on 13<sup>th</sup> August 2004 in Committee Room No.1, Parliament House, Islamabad under the Chairpersonship of Senator Mrs. Razina Alam Khan.</p>	<p>Agenda before the meeting was as under:-</p> <p>1. Detailed briefing on the working mechanism of the following Departments of the Ministry of Science and Technology:</p> <p>a) Pakistan Scientific &amp; Technological Information Center;</p> <p>b) National Physical Standard Laboratory;</p> <p>c) Pakistan Council of Scientific and Industrial Research.</p> <p>ii. Any other item with permission of the Chair.</p>	<p>Following recommendations were made by the Standing Committee:-</p> <p>1. The remaining public service sections of PASTIC which were not ISO certified should be certified immediately so as to ensure prompt delivery of Science and Technology Information.</p> <p>2. National Science Reference Library should be further developed and strengthened in the greater interest of the country.</p> <p>3. The Science Reference Libraries should be established in every province for the benefit of the public.</p> <p>4. The services of Human resource development section, computer training Labs, Software package for Library Automation should be further strengthened.</p> <p>5. The services of the international data base on CD-ROM maintained at PASTIC should be further improved.</p> <p>6. The training for information/library personnel working in environmental health institutions should be encouraged.</p> <p>7. The activities of UNESCO Regional Network for exchange of information experiences in Science and Technology in Asia and the Pacific should be made more effective and result oriented.</p> <p>8. Regular publications of local science journals should be published from the organizations concerned on time.</p> <p>9. The budget demanded by PASTIC regarding shortage of non-development fund, shortage of space technical manpower should be provided to PASTIC for scientific and technological research and development in the country.</p>

			<p>In respect of PCSIR, the committee recommended that:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. A three member sub-committee viz Professor Muhammad Saeed Siddiqui as its Chairman and Senators Prof. Muhammad Ibrahim and Roshan Khursheed Bharucha as its members to make recommendations for establishing linkage between Science and Industries and submit report to the Standing Committee.</li> <li>2. The committee called upon the government to allocate more fund for building the base and also for strengthening the institution dedicated to scientific research with a view to achieve the desired national objectives.</li> <li>3. The useful work being done by PCSIR and other organizations devoted to the development of scientific base in the country needs to be properly projected and highlighted. The electronic media may introduce within science and technology minute in their news bulletin to apprise the general public of the useful work being done by our national scientific organizations.</li> <li>4. The committee shall visit the labs of PCSIR located in the country to evaluate their performance and will suggest ways and means for further improvement.</li> </ol>
4	<p>Meeting of the Standing Committee on Education and Scientific and Technological Research was held on 2<sup>nd</sup> September 2004 in Committee Room No.4, Parliament House, Islamabad, under the Chairpersonship of Senator Razina Alam Khan.</p>	<p>Agenda before the Committee meeting was as under:-</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Detailed briefing from Science &amp; Technology Wing and Education for All Wing on their working and performance.</li> <li>2. Any other item with permission of the Chair.</li> </ol>	<p>Following recommendations were made by the Committee:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Effective monitoring system should be adopted to evaluate the working and performance of the various projects under the control of Ministry of Education.</li> <li>2. The Ministry of Education should lay focus on evaluating its programme initiated under Primary Education, Literacy and Non-formal Education and Education For All Sectors.</li> <li>3. The number of Polytechnic Institute should be increased to meet the present requirements of the country.</li> <li>4. Necessary arrangements should be made to exploit new technologies for the benefit of unemployment or semi literate youth.</li> <li>5. The Polytechnic Institutes should be set up at Turbat, Khuzdar and Gwadar in Balochistan to facilitate the people of that province.</li> <li>6. The under-construction Polytechnic Institute for Boys should be completed within the stipulated period.</li> <li>7. The Committee shall visit EFA Centers established by Ministry of Education in four provinces to evaluate their working and performance.</li> <li>8. Mass media programmes should be arranged to motivate the children towards education.</li> <li>9. The curriculum of the education should be same all over the country in order to avoid discrimination amongst the students.</li> <li>10. The amenities i.e fans, water, cleanliness, furniture etc should be provided to the students in the Educational Institutions all over the</li> </ol>

			<p>country.</p> <p>11. The sanctioned strength of teaching staff should be provided to all the Educational Institutions.</p> <p>12. Proper maintenance/repair of the Educational Institutions should be done where necessary.</p> <p>13. The funds allocated for FATA Educational Institutions should be utilized for the betterment of that area.</p> <p>14. Arrangement should be made for opening of more schools for girls and boys in rural and under-developed areas of the country.</p> <p>15. There should be a monitoring system on the working and performance of the NGOs relating to Education.</p> <p>16. Proper training should be arranged for technical teaching staff.</p>
5	<p>Meeting of the Standing Committee on Education and Scientific and Technological Research was held on 8<sup>th</sup> November 2004 in Committee Room No.1, Parliament House, Islamabad, under the Chairpersonship of Senator Mrs. Razina Alam Khan</p>	<p>Agenda before the Committee meeting was as under:-</p> <p>Briefing on:-</p> <p>1. Further progress on the issue of Curriculum/ Syllabus by the Curriculum Wing.</p> <p>2. Admission policy framed by the FDE in Federal Government Schools/ Colleges at Islamabad and also for FATA/ NA students with reference to Supreme Court judgment.</p> <p>3. Training of teaching staff.</p> <p>4. Registration of Private Schools in the Federal Areas.</p> <p>5. Any other item with permission of the Chair.</p>	<p>Following recommendations were made by the Committee:</p> <p>1. Proper vigilance should be kept on the printing of Text Books by the concerned Text Boards in order to make them free from errors/mistakes. The Ministry concerned should also check the Text Books before issuance of NOC by them.</p> <p>2. The Ministry of Education should review the syllabus being taught by the Private Schools to bring it at par with the Government Schools.</p> <p>3. The text contained in the Text Books should be free from any kind of prejudice which may injure the feelings of Muslims.</p> <p>4. Strict watch should be kept on the printing of Text Books by the concerned quarters.</p> <p>5. Teaching of English and Urdu, History and Geography should be encouraged in the Government Educational Institutions in order to prepare our younger generation to meet the future challenges.</p> <p>6. The material contained in the Text Books should also be free of extremism, terrorism and sectarianism.</p> <p>7. Technical education in different trades should be encouraged in the country.</p> <p>8. All out efforts should be made to ensure that the cycle of training teachers by the NISTE continues throughout the year.</p> <p>9. New concept/emerging trends should be further strengthened.</p> <p>10. Further arrangements should be made to establish more schools/colleges in the Federal Capital Territory in order to accommodate all the students.</p> <p>11. Efforts should be made for starting double shifts in all the schools/colleges of Islamabad in order to solve the admission problems.</p>

			<p>12. The students belonging to FATA/ FANA should be given admission in the Colleges/ Schools as per decision of the Supreme Court for Medical Colleges.</p> <p>13. More Colleges/Schools for Girls and Boys should be established in various sectors of Islamabad and also in the rural areas of Federal Capital Territory.</p> <p>14. School and Colleges should be established all over the country in order to enhance the literacy rate in the country.</p> <p>15. All the private schools located in Islamabad and rural areas of Capital Territory should be registered.</p>
6	Meeting of the Standing Committee on Education and Scientific and Technological Research was held on 7 <sup>th</sup> December 2004 in Committee Room No.1, parliament House, Islamabad under the Chairpersonship of Senator Razina Alam Khan.	<p>Agenda before the Committee meeting was as under:-</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Approval of the recommendations given by the Sub-Committee on the Curriculum Issue.</li> <li>2. Consider further steps/suggestions by the Members to improve the working of the Committee.</li> <li>3. Finalize a plan/ programme to meet with the stake holders of Provincial Ministries of Education for consultation and improvement of Education sector in the country.</li> <li>4. Any other item with permission of the Chair.</li> </ol>	<p>No recommendations made. Some of the issues taken up included:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. The members of the Committee brought to the notice of Chairperson Standing Committee that proper T.V coverage of the meetings of the Standing Committee was not being given by the PTV. Chairperson remarked that it was the right of the Committee and we shall solve it on priority basis.</li> <li>2. The report of the Sub-Committee on Curriculum was presented before the Standing Committee meeting for its approval. The Committee unanimously made the amendments in the report of Sub-Committee held on 24.11.2004 at 3.00 p.m. as follows:-          "In para 2 of the report for the word "Curriculum" the words "text book" shall be substituted"</li> </ol>
7	Meeting of the Standing Committee on Education (Education and Scientific and Technological Research) was held on 15 <sup>th</sup> December 2004 in Committee Room No.4, Parliament House, Islamabad, under the Chairpersonship of Senator Razina Alam Khan.	<p>Agenda before the Committee meeting was as under:-</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Briefing on the working and performance of the Higher Education Commission; and</li> <li>2. Any other item with permission of the Chair.</li> </ol>	<p>Following recommendations were made by the Committee:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. The Human Resource Development efforts made by HEC should be tailored in a way so as to meet the requirements of different sectors.</li> <li>2. National Scholarship system for talented students should be introduced as is prevalent in various countries.</li> <li>3. The Universities, being the center of learning and knowledge should be made the center of national integration.</li> <li>4. Qualified Professors should be provided to the old Universities to achieve the minimum standards.</li> </ol>

			<p>5. Necessary arrangements should be made by increasing a number of seats for students in different faculties in the Universities for getting higher education.</p> <p>6. Fund should be distributed equally to each University so that the less developed areas of the country could not be ignored.</p> <p>7. The Universities should be places of national integration.</p> <p>8. Admission in the Universities should be given on merit.</p> <p>9. Level of examination standard should be determined.</p> <p>10. All Research programmes should be advertised through mass media.</p> <p>11. Monitoring system to evaluate the performance of the universities should be introduced.</p> <p>12. Students belonging to backward areas of the country should be encouraged in getting admission in higher education.</p> <p>13. Budget allocation for the higher education and research should be increased manifold.</p>
<b>2005</b>			
8	<p>Meeting of the Standing Committee on Education and Scientific and Technological Research was held on 18<sup>th</sup> January 2005 in Committee Room No.1, Parliament House, Islamabad, under the Chairpersonship of Senator Razina Alam Khan.</p>	<p>Agenda before the Committee meeting was as under:-</p> <p>i. Presentation by the Higher Education Commission regarding the Universities established by the private sector.</p> <p>ii. The criteria for opening of Private Universities.</p> <p>iii. Any other item with permission of the Chair.</p>	<p>Following recommendations were made by the Committee:-</p> <p>1. The universities and the institutes of higher learning in back ward areas of Balochistan and NWFP should be brought at par with the educational institutions and universities of national stature as it would pave the way for national integration.</p> <p>2. Best efforts should be made for provision of quality education keeping in view the ground realities.</p> <p>3. The criteria laid down for establishment of a new university/institution of higher education in the private sector needs to be reviewed and proper incentives such as tax concession, provision of land free of cost/at subsidies rates, soft loans and matching grants should be provided to the people desirous of establishing universities/institutes of higher learning in the private sector.</p> <p>4. Steps should be taken to set up/grant recognition to two more universities in Balochistan in order to facilitate the people in getting education. Similar steps should be taken in other parts of the country.</p> <p>5. Necessary steps should be taken to discourage the mushroom growth of illegal institutions/universities.</p> <p>6. Funds should be released to the Universities/Institutions according to their demand and a monitoring system be evolved on the utilization of the funds.</p> <p>7. The Universities in NWFP and Balochistan should be further strengthened to cater the needs of education for the people of those</p>

			<p>provinces.</p> <p>8. Criteria for admission in Universities should not be too hard.</p> <p>9. The Committee shall visit the Universities/Institutes located in the four provinces to evaluate their working and performance.</p> <p>10. A sub-committee headed by Senator Dr. Muhammad Said, and Senator Roshan Khusheed Bharucha, Senator Dr. Nighat Agha and Senator Professor Muhammad Saeed Siddiqui as its members, was constituted to study the various aspects of the issue of establishment of new universities in the public/private sectors and suggest ways and means to bring about a qualitative change in the standard of universities/institutes of higher learning.</p>
9	<p>Meeting of the Standing Committee on Science and Technology (Education and Science and Technological Research) held on 27<sup>th</sup> January 2005 in Committee Room No.1, Parliament House, Islamabad, under the Chairpersonship of Senator Razina Alam Khan</p>	<p>Agenda before the Committee meeting was as under:-</p> <p>1. Detailed briefing on the working and mechanism of the following Departments of Ministry of Science and Technology:-</p> <p>i. Pakistan Science foundation, and</p> <p>ii. Pakistan Council of Research and Water Resources (PCRWR);</p> <p>iii. Any other item with permission of the Chair.</p>	<p>Following recommendations were made by the Committee:-</p> <p>1. Best efforts should be made for coordination between science and industry.</p> <p>2. Further improvement should be made in the Universities and Research Institutes on Scientific problems related to socio-economic needs/developments of the country.</p> <p>3. Arrangements should be made for public awareness through media about science promotion activities.</p> <p>4. The working of foreign funded projects should be further streamlined and strengthened and proper monitoring be kept on theirs working and on utilization of funds.</p> <p>5. Arrangements should be made to develop science culture in the country.</p> <p>6. Arrangements should be made for opening of Science Centers in the country preferably in under developed areas.</p> <p>7. The achievements made by the PSF and PCRWR should be advertised through mass media for public awareness.</p> <p>8. Problems of sedimentation in storage reservoirs should be solved in the country.</p> <p>9. Best efforts should be made for coordination and promotion of research on all aspects of water resources development and management in the country.</p> <p>10. Publication of scientific papers reports and periodicals should be further streamlined.</p> <p>11. The problem of bacterial contamination in the water should be solved by the concerned quarters.</p> <p>12. The quality of tube well water should be further increased.</p> <p>13. The Committee shall visit Leaky Dam Project at Margat Quetta to</p>

			<p>evaluate their performance.</p> <p>14. The ongoing R&amp;D projects should be completed within the stipulated period.</p> <p>15. Drinking water issue in Cholistan area should be solved on priority basis.</p> <p>16. The working of National Water Quality Monitoring Programme should be further strengthened to achieve its goal.</p> <p>17. The problems of Arsenic/ nitrate contamination fluoride contamination should solved on priority basis.</p>
10	Meeting of the Sub-Committee on Education was held on 15 <sup>th</sup> February 2005 in the Office of the Chairperson Standing Committee on Education and Science and Technological Research, Old US Aid Building, Islamabad under the Chairmanship of Senator Dr. Muhammad Said.	<p>Agenda before the Sub-Committee meeting was as under:-</p> <p>i. To study various aspects of the issue of establishment of new universities in the public/private sectors and suggest ways and means to bring about a qualitative change in the standard of universities/institutes of higher education.</p> <p>ii. Any other item with permission of the Chair.</p>	<p>The Sub-committee took the following decisions:-</p> <p>1. The Sub-committee shall visit all the private Universities of category C and D located in the country in the last week of March 2005 to evaluate their working and performance.</p> <p>2. The Sub-Committee shall also visit at least one University falling under Category-A, to check its working and performance. The Committee shall also visit Gandhara University at Peshawar.</p> <p>3. No representative of the Ministry of Education/Higher Education Commission shall be called in the meetings/visit to be held in the four provinces.</p> <p>4. The extracts from the “guidelines for the establishment of a new university or an institution of higher education” published by the Higher Education Commission will be sent to the Private Universities for obtaining their comments/views up to 10<sup>th</sup> March 2005 for onward transmission to the members of the sub-committee.</p>
11	Meeting of the Standing Committee on Education and Science and Technological Research held on 22 <sup>nd</sup> February 2005 in Committee Room No.1, Parliament House, Islamabad, under the Chairpersonship of Senator Razina Alam Khan.	<p>Agenda before the Committee meeting was as under:-</p> <p>i. Briefing on the selection and performance of the Review Committee on curriculum, constituted by the Ministry of Education.</p> <p>ii. Presentation on the jurisdiction and control of the Ministry of Education over the Private Schools.</p> <p>iii. Any other item with permission of the Chair.</p>	<p>Following recommendations were made by the Committee:-</p> <p>1. The curriculum should be reflective of moral, ethics and address social evils. It should be revised according to the modern day needs.</p> <p>2. The syllabus should be made according to the national norms and moral values and the national curriculum policy be in line with the education policy.</p> <p>3. The selection of the material for the text books should be focused/made according to the Ideology of Pakistan highlighting the moral ethics.</p> <p>4. All controversial topics/material in the text books which injure the feeling of Muslims belonging to different sects should be excluded and make it acceptable to all the Islamic sects while reviewing Islamic Studies etc.</p> <p>5. A proper monitoring system should be evolved to check the working and performance of the Curriculum Wing and the respective Text Boards.</p>

			<p>6. Proper attention should be paid to include the lessons about patriotism and moral education in the text books.</p> <p>7. Necessary arrangements should be made for provision of free text books upto primary/middle level to all the students in the country.</p> <p>8. Necessary arrangements should be made for availability of text books in the open market in order to avoid difficulties.</p> <p>9. Best efforts should be made to reduce the fee of private schools/institutions in the country.</p> <p>10. The private schools, institutions, colleges and universities should obtain NOC from the Regulatory Authority before their establishing.</p> <p>11. Necessary arrangements should be made to curtail the load of text books for the students of primary level.</p> <p>12. Proper check should also be kept on the utilization of funds of private schools, institutions, colleges and universities in the country.</p> <p>13. Arrangements should be made to develop technical education in the country.</p>
12	Meeting of the Sub-Committee on Science and Technology was held on 7 <sup>th</sup> April 2005 at 4.00 p.m. at the residence of Senator Dr. Nighat Agha in Lahore under the Chairmanship of Senator Dr. Muhammad Said.	<p>Agenda before the Sub-Committee meeting was as under:-</p> <p>To study the various aspects of the issue of establishment of new universities in the public/private sectors and suggest ways and means to bring about a qualitative change in the standard of universities/institutes of higher education.</p>	<p>After discussions, the Convener and members of the Committee decided as follows:-</p> <p>1. Senator Dr. Muhammad Said, will prepare a proforma indicating the information to be required from the universities. The proforma will be handed over to the members of the Sub-committee up to 15<sup>th</sup> April 2005 and will be received back by 28<sup>th</sup> instant from the members after consulting the concerned universities.</p> <p>2. After receipt of the information from the Universities by the members, final report of the Sub-committee shall be submitted to the Standing Committee on Science and Technology on or after 12<sup>th</sup> May 2005.</p>
13	Meeting of the Standing Committee on Education and Science and Technology was held on 7 <sup>th</sup> April 2005 in PMIU 3 <sup>rd</sup> Floor Gulberg, Heights, Near Sherpao Bridge, Jail Road, Lahore under the Chairpersonship of Senator Razina Alam Khan.	<p>Agenda before the Committee meeting was as under:-</p> <p>1. Briefing on working of the Punjab Education Department by Minister for Education and Secretary Education, Punjab.</p> <p>2. Presentation and briefing on the PESRP and PMIU by Director Program, PESRP.</p>	Just briefings; some general remarks by the Chairperson; no specific recommendations were made.

		<p>3. Briefing on working of Literacy &amp; Non Formal Basic Education Department by Secretary, Literacy and Non formal Education Department, Punjab, Lahore.</p> <p>4. Departure from PMIU to the Office of the Advisor to CM Punjab</p> <p>5. Presentation by Miss Faiza Asghar, Adviser, Children Rights, Govt. of Punjab, on Child Protection and Welfare Bureau.</p> <p>6. Any other item with permission of the Chair.</p>	
14	<p>Meeting of the Standing Committee on Science and Technology (Education and Science and Technology) was held on 21<sup>st</sup> April 2005 in Committee Room No.1, Parliament House, Islamabad, under the Chairpersonship of Senator Razina Alam Khan.</p>	<p>Agenda before the Committee meeting was as under:-</p> <p>1. Detailed briefing on the working mechanism of the following Departments of Ministry of Science &amp; Technology.</p> <p>i) Pakistan Council for Renewable Energy Technologies (PCRET)</p> <p>ii. Pakistan Technology Board (PTB);</p> <p>iii. Any other item with permission of the Chair.</p>	<p>Following recommendations were made by the Committee:-</p> <p>1. The PTB should analyze socio economic objectives with a view to determine the technological area of relevance in order to identify and select key technologies for inclusion in the national plan of action.</p> <p>2. Technology foresight exercise should be carried out in a systematic way in order to help in improving the quality of government decisions making.</p> <p>3. All out efforts should be made to ensure the benefits of research carried out by research organizations could reach to the common man.</p> <p>4. Best efforts should be made to promote the culture of research in the country besides creating awareness among the general public.</p> <p>5. The Government should allocate more funds for the organizations of the Ministry of Science and Technology entrusted with the task of developing and promoting research.</p> <p>6. Efforts should be made to complete the process for composition of Pakistan Technology Board/staff strength as early as possible to achieve the desired goal of research.</p> <p>7. Better incentives should be given to the Scientists to be appointed for PTB and PCRET so that they could work devotedly in the field of science and technology.</p> <p>8. The Committee shall visit the different ongoing projects of PTB and PCRET shortly in consultation with the Ministry of Science and Technology to evaluate their working and performance in the field of science and technology.</p> <p>9. It should be ensured that the people of all the provinces equally benefit</p>

			from the projects of Ministry of Science and Technology. In this connection, the under developed areas of the country may be given preference.
15	Meeting of the Standing Committee on Education and Science and Technology was held on 16 <sup>th</sup> May 2005 in Committee Room No.4, Parliament House, Islamabad, under the Chairpersonship of Senator Razina Alam Khan.	Agenda before the Committee meeting was as under:-  i. Briefing on the working/performance of the Federal Board of Intermediate and Secondary Education (FBISE).  ii. Role and Functions of Education for All (EFA) Unit of Ministry of Education, Islamabad.  iii. Any other item with permission of the Chair.	Following recommendations were made by the Committee:-  1. The Committee agreed to the proposal of obtaining military help to boost the literacy rate in the country.  2. Best efforts should be made to increase the literacy rate in the under developed and far flung areas of the country. Proper attention should be paid to FATA/FANA in this regard.  3. Latest progress report on EFA may be sent to the Standing Committee for consideration.  4. The monitoring should be made on the recruitment of teaching staff in the literacy projects in the country.  5. Best efforts should be made to adopt the new examination system by the Ministry of Education so that the problems of maximum student could be addressed.  6. FBISE, should try its level best to further improve its working and performance to achieve its objectives and desired goal.
16	Meeting of the Standing Committee on Education and Science and Technology was held on 18 <sup>th</sup> May 2005 in Committee Room No.1, Parliament House, Islamabad, under the Chairpersonship of Senator Razina Alam Khan.	Agenda before the Committee meeting was as under:-  i. Discussion and approval of the report of Sub-Committee on criteria for the establishment of private universities.  ii. Any other item with permission of the Chair.	Following recommendations were made by the Committee:-  1. The Committee discussed the report by the sub-committee, headed by Senator Dr. Muhammad Said and Senators Roshan Khurheed Bharucha, Nighat Agha and Professor Muhammad Saeed Siddiqui as its members, on various aspects of the issue of establishment of new universities in private sectors to bring about a qualitative change in the standards of universities/institute of higher learning.  2. After detailed deliberations/discussions the following recommendations of the sub-committee were disagreed by the HEC:-  <b>2.1 Teaching Faculty:</b> i. (a) Since Ph. D degree holders are not available in disciplines like, Computer Science, Information Technology, Business Administration and Engineering, therefore this condition may be deferred until 2010, by which time hopefully, qualified teachers would be available.  ii. (c) Professors must have a Ph. D degree but Associate Professors may be a Master's degree holder with ten years experience of teaching and research.  <b>2.6 Senate</b> iii. (b) The Board of Governor should have a member, representing the Senate of Pakistan.  <b>2.8 Time Period</b> iv. (a) The development of a university is a long process. It takes sometime for the search and appointment of suitable faculty, and for the

			<p>establishment of laboratories, library and other teaching facilities. This is done in a gradual and phased manner. Five years is not enough for the private universities to come up to the HEC standard requirements. The grace period allowed by the Federal Cabinet needs to be relaxed, and the universities may be given a grace period of at least eight years.</p> <p>3. The Committee unanimously adopted the Resolution which reads as under:-</p> <p>“Higher Education Commission has offered the public universities to share with them 50% of the cost for improving the standards of the Faculties by employing more qualified Professors from within and outside the country.</p> <p>This facility should be equally made available to the private universities which come up to the required standard that may be prescribed by the Higher Education Commission.”</p> <p>4. Senator Mrs. Razina Alam Khan, Chairperson Standing Committee and its members said that the role of teachers could not be denied and it is the need of the hour to increase their salaries. The Committee observed that the promotion of higher education has become necessary as currently only 2.9% people have access to higher learning which is lower than our neighboring countries. It was further observed by the Committee that it is sad movement for all of us that no university of Pakistan was listed out of 500 best universities of the World.</p> <p>5. The Committee also recommended as follows:-</p> <p>i. No compromise should be made on the quality and standard of both private and public sector universities and stressed the need for imparting quality education to put the country on the track towards development.</p> <p>ii. The salaries of teachers should be increased for their laborious services in the field of education.</p> <p>iii. The government should allocate 3% of GDP for the education in the upcoming budget.</p> <p>iv. Ministry of Finance should release funds to the HEC according to their demand in order to improve further its working and performance.</p> <p>v. Discussions will be made in the meeting of the Standing Committee on Education and Science and Technology on the matching grants of HEC after Annual Budget 2005-06 in which HEC, Ministry of Finance and Planning Division be invited to settle the parameters for the grants.</p> <p>vi. Necessary action should be taken against the illegal campus of the universities.</p>
17	Meeting of the Standing Committee on Education (Education and Science and Technology) was held on 25 <sup>th</sup> June 2005 in Committee Room No.1,	<p>Agenda before the Committee meeting was as under:-</p> <p>i. Briefing on the plan for extending</p>	<p>After discussions on the issue of extending necessary support to the eligible private sectors universities and revised criteria for the establishment of universities the Committee observed and recommended as under:-</p> <p>1. The government should extend assistance to private sector universities</p>

	<p>Parliament House, Islamabad, under the Chairpersonship of Senator Razina Alam Khan.</p>	<p>necessary support to the eligible private sector universities.</p> <p>ii. Revised criteria for the establishment of universities in private sectors in view of the discussions held in the meeting of the Standing Committee on 18.5.05.</p> <p>iii. Any other item with permission of the Chair.</p>	<p>according to some predetermined criteria. It was suggested that as a first step degree awarding institute status should be granted and only those institute which fulfilled the criteria laid down by the HEC should be given the status of universities. This step it was felt by the Committee would go a long way in blocking the mushroom growth of the universities in the private sector.</p> <p>2. The Committee recommended that more financial aid should be given to universities located in the under developed areas of the countries.</p> <p>3. It was also recommended that instead of sending our students for higher education in European countries, foreign experts should be invited in Pakistan so as to give patronage to our universities and colleges.</p> <p>4. The Chairperson of the Committee has said that strict observance of criteria fixed for establishment of universities in both the private and the public sector will bring in much needed order for improving the quality of higher education in the country. The Chairperson said that it is very unfortunate that only 2.9% aid access to higher education in Pakistan and in this connection the Committee recommended that some mechanism should be found to assist the universities in the private sector in order to increase people's access to higher education.</p> <p>5. The Committee emphasized the need for discouraging fragmentation of the society by creating opportunities for the elite only and recommended for providing financial assistance to the universities in the far flung and under developed areas of the country.</p> <p>6. The scholarship should be given to the deserving students of the universities.</p> <p>7. Best efforts should be made for the availability of books in the libraries of the Universities.</p> <p>8. The working and performance of the museums under HEC should be further strengthened.</p> <p>9. Best efforts should be made for establishing science museums in the country.</p> <p>10. Senator Dr. Muhammad Said would prepare a final report after discussion on the sub-committee report with HEC presented before the Standing Committee on 18.5.2005. After preparation the final report will be presented before the Standing Committee.</p> <p>11. The Ministry of Education should pay the Research Allowance of Rs.5000/-p.m. to all the Ph. D. holders teachers. There should be no discrimination in this regard.</p> <p>12. Financial help should be given to the weak universities so that they could improve their working and performance.</p>
18	<p>Meeting of the Standing Committee on Science and Technology (Education and Science</p>	<p>Agenda before the Committee meeting was as under:-</p>	<p>After discussions on the briefing, the members of the Committee raised certain questions regarding improvement of Science and Technology in the country, the following recommendations were made to achieve the desired goal:-</p>

	<p>and Technology) was held on 6<sup>th</sup> July 2005 in Committee Room No.4, Parliament House, Islamabad under the Chairpersonship of Senator Razina Alam Khan.</p>	<p>i. Briefing on:</p> <p>a. Progress of the Report of the Sub-Committee on Linkage between Industry and Educational Institutions of Science &amp; Technology.</p> <p>b. Working and performance of COMSATS Institute of Information Technology.</p> <p>ii. Any other item with permission of the Chair.</p>	<p>1. The recommendations of the Sub-Committee should be implemented in the best interest of the country.</p> <p>2. All out efforts should be made to ensure that the benefits of Research works carried out by the Research Organizations of the Science and Technology are utilized in industrial, agricultural and other sectors with ultimate aim to improve the life standard of common man.</p> <p>3. The revival of PTB should be made by the concerned quarters to enable the Ministry of Science and Technology and its attached departments to make a significant contribution for the socio economic development of Pakistan.</p> <p>4. Best efforts should be made to launch new CIIT projects in the four provinces of the country.</p> <p>5. More funds should be allocated for organizations entrusted with the task of developing and promoting research in the field of Science and Technology.</p> <p>6. The Committee shall visit the Campus of COMSATS at Lahore to evaluate its working and performance at the spot as invited by honourable Minister for S&amp;T.</p> <p>7. Best efforts should also be made for linkages between industry and educational institutions of Science and Technology so as to put the country on the development track.</p>
19	<p>Meeting of the Standing Committee on Education (Education and Science and Technology) was held on 29<sup>th</sup> July 2005 in Committee Room No.1, Parliament House, Islamabad under the Chairpersonship of Senator Razina Alam Khan.</p>	<p>Agenda before the Committee meeting was as under:-</p> <p>i. Briefing on:-</p> <p>a. The working/performance of the National College of Arts (NCA)</p> <p>b. The teaching of formal subjects in Deeni Madaris (Madrassah Reforms)</p> <p>ii. Any other item with permission of the Chair.</p>	<p>The following recommendations were made by the Committee vis-à-vis the NCA:-</p> <p>1. The Government should allocate more funds to NCA for its further improvement and developing linkages at the regional level.</p> <p>2. Chief Minister's Inspection Team Building at Lahore should be given to NCA as demanded, for smooth and efficient running of its working and performance.</p> <p>3. The Committee shall visit NCA Lahore in the near future to evaluate its working and performance on the spot on the invitation of Principal, NCA.</p> <p>4. Efforts should be made to motivate people for donation to NCA for its better functioning.</p> <p>5. Efforts should be made to establish a calligraphic department in NCA.</p> <p>6. Best efforts should be made by the NCA to open under graduate degree programme in the provinces according to the requirements of the people of that area.</p> <p>7. NCA should reduce fee of its different courses so that poor people could get benefit.</p> <p>8. Necessary budget allocation should be made to NCA to construct hostel for their students.</p>

			<p>Following recommendations were made by the Committee vis-à-vis madaris:-</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. The Ministry of Education should expedite the work on the implementation of the Project of Madrassah Reforms and collect data about the registration of the Deeni Madaris.</li> <li>2. Best efforts should be made to introduce teaching worldly knowledge along with religious education in Deeni Madaris to enable the students to face the challenges of modern life and protect a soft image of Pakistan.</li> <li>3. The Ministry of Education should try its level best to motivate the Madaris for registration and conduct a survey to know the exact figure of these institutions.</li> <li>4. There should be categorization of Deeni Madaris on the basis of strength and the performance while making registration to them;</li> <li>5. The Ministry of Education should take necessary feed back about the funds disbursed to the Provincial Governments for improving the condition of registered Deeni Madaris.</li> <li>6. The syllabus of Jamia Ashrafia should be kept in view while introducing Reforms in all the Deeni Madaris in the country.</li> <li>7. A copy of the Ordinance called the Pakistan Madrasa Education (Establishment and Affiliation of Model Deeni Madaris) Board should be provided the Standing Committee for further necessary action.</li> <li>8. There should be play grounds and Libraries in Deeni Madrasa for their students.</li> <li>9. Linkage between Wafaqul Madaris should be further strengthened.</li> <li>10. English, General Science and Computer Science subjects should also be taught in Deeni Madaris.</li> <li>11. Best efforts should be made to introduce a new law immediately for the registration of Deeni Madaris in consultation with the Ministries of Education, Religious Affairs and Law.</li> <li>12. Best efforts should be made by the provincial governments for proper utilization of all the funds provided to Deeni Madaris located in their respective areas.</li> <li>13. Senator S. M. Zafar presented a Resolution before the Committee and it was unanimously passed as under:-</li> </ol> <p>“Committee records its appreciation of the position response of HEC in supporting the plan for extending necessary support to the eligible private sector Universities including the provision for matching grants for Foreign Faculty Hiring.</p> <p>As every academic year counts in the educational development the Committee would urge the government to decide the package of support</p>
--	--	--	---

			to Private Universities as soon as possible. However, the issue of matching grants for foreign faculty be decided before the academic year begins”.
20	Meeting of the Standing Committee on Education and Science and Technology was held on 3 <sup>rd</sup> August 2005 in Committee Room No.1, Parliament House, Islamabad under the Chairmanship of Senator Mrs. Razina Alam Khan.	<p>Agenda before the Committee meeting was as under:-</p> <p>i) Finalization of the report prepared by the Sub-Committee on criteria for the establishment of private universities.</p> <p>ii) Briefing on:</p> <p>a) The system of categorization of the universities by Higher Education Commission.</p> <p>b) National Testing Service Examination.</p> <p>iii. Any other item with the permission of the Chair.</p>	<p>1. Senator Dr. Muhammad Said briefed the Committee that he and members of the Sub-committee, namely Senator Roshan Khursheed Bharucha, Senator Dr. Nighat Agha and Senator Professor Muhammad Saeed Siddiqui, had prepared a report on problems being faced by the private universities with regard to the criteria prescribed by the HEC for establishment of private universities in the country. He requested that Higher Education Commission should consider the recommendations prepared by the Committee in its report.</p> <p>2. Dr. Atta-ur-Rehman, Chairman, HEC, informed that private universities had been given a cut of date of the year 2007 to have the required number of Ph. Ds in their various Departments for which the criteria has been laid down by HEC. The Committee was also informed that a comprehensive plan has been prepared in the light of recommendations given by the Committee to extend financial support in the field of research land acquisition and foreign faculty hiring etc to the private institutes. In this connection, four different categories have been evolved for categorization of universities/institutions. Moreover, the ranking of the institutes of higher learning in the private sector would also be made and data has been collected from the universities as it is a matter of nation significance.</p> <p>3. The Chairman, HEC suggested that the requirements of Ph. D level faculties members in universities should be enhanced to 05 Ph. D level faculty members per department with a minimum of 04 departments per university. The Committee agreed to the proposal.</p> <p>4. The Higher Education Commission did not agree to some of the recommendations of the sub-committee and it was decided that the recommendations approved by HEC should be reconsidered in the meeting of the sub-committee to be held on 22<sup>nd</sup> August 2005. Afterwards, the same will be place before the Committee for approval.</p> <p>5. The Committee also stressed the need for knowledge based education and improvement of the quality of higher education in the country.</p> <p>In addition to the above discussions, following recommendations were made by the Committee:-</p> <p>1. There should be greater transparency while awarding foreign scholarships and conducting test for sending the students abroad.</p> <p>2. There should be no compromise on quality education.</p> <p>3. Best efforts should be made to bring at par higher education in the country with the foreign education standard.</p> <p>4. Additional funds should be provided to the NCA to make it strengthened and result oriented.</p> <p>5. Best efforts should be made to establish National College of Arts in four provinces.</p>

21	Meeting of the Standing Committee on Education (Education and Science and Technology) was held on 5 <sup>th</sup> September 2005 in Committee Room No.4, Parliament House, Islamabad, under the Acting Chairmanship of Senator S. M. Zafar.	<p>Agenda before the Committee meeting was as under:-</p> <p>(i) Approval of the recommendations prepared by the Sub-Committee regarding amendments in the criteria for the establishment of Private Universities.</p> <p>(ii) Finalization of the Programme of the Standing Committee on Education to visit the Provincial Education Departments/Institutions.</p> <p>(iii) Any other item with permission of the Chair.</p>	<p>1. Senator Dr. Muhammad Said, Convener Sub-Committee presented the Report of the Committee before the Standing Committee. The Acting Chairman informed that, due to the efforts of the Sub-Committee, the Higher Education Commission has agreed to provide some benefits/facilities to private universities and also for providing land on lease to them for extension of their infrastructure in order to upgrade the working and performance of private universities. The Acting Chairman Standing Committee appreciated the sub-committee for formulating the amendments in the criteria for the establishment of private universities, which would be forwarded to Higher Education Commission for implementation.</p> <p>2. Senator Dr. Muhammad Said, informed the Committee that he and members of the sub-committee visited various private universities in the country to obtain their views/comments on the criteria laid down by the Higher Education Commission regarding establishment of new private universities. He further told the Committee, the aims and objectives of the recommendations proposed by the sub-committee in its Report regarding criteria for the establishment of private universities which are narrated as under:-</p> <p>i. Basic Sciences are essential for those universities which conduct programme in Science, Engineering &amp; Technology but Basic Sciences should not be necessary for those private universities which conduct courses in Management Sciences, Business Administration etc.</p> <p>ii. It is extremely difficult to acquire 10 acres of land for a university in large cities like Karachi, Lahore, Peshawar, Quetta and Islamabad and therefore this condition was relaxed.</p> <p>iii. There was complaint from private universities that the rating of the private universities was not carried out objectively. Therefore, there was a need for an impartial body to conduct the exercise of rating on factors of variables which are identifiable and quantifiable.</p> <p>iv. The investment fund of Rs.50 million as Endowment Fund was not practical as with the increasing inflation rate, the 50 million invested in a bank would reduce to 10 million in ten years time. Therefore, it is essential that the Endowment Fund is invested in a financially suitable estate property and secure income bearing scheme.</p> <p>v. Where there is a provision of Board of Governors in the charter of private university, Senate would duplicate the function of the Board of Governors and hence it was not deemed necessary.</p> <p>3. Members also gave their point of view as follows:-</p> <p>a) It was suggested that the setting up of Basic Science Department should not be a compulsion for a private university if it is not offering degree programmes in Basic Science, Engineering and Technology.</p> <p>b) It was felt that the gross area requirement of 10 acres, for setting up of a private university is too harsh as it was too difficult to acquire 10</p>
----	---	---	---

			<p>acres of land in big cities.</p> <p>c) It was also felt that the criteria may be revised and the university having three acre of land inside the city and 07 acres on the city fringes for the provision of sports facilities be approved.</p> <p>4. The Committee discussed the Report of the Sub-Committee clause by clause and unanimously approved some amendments in the Report for the establishment of private universities.</p> <p>5. The Acting Chairman, presented a Resolution before the Standing Committee on Education and Science and Technology which reads as under:-</p> <p>“Whereas the Committee welcomed the decision of the Government of Pakistan and Higher Education Commission to extend some facilities to private universities as are made available to public universities. And in particular to provide land on lease to private universities for extension of infrastructure.</p> <p>The Committee is of the considered view that it is equally important and logical too that private universities which own or have acquired land yet lack funds to build additional facilities (like hostels, labs and library) may in similar terms as apply to grant of land, be provided funds for designate construction.”</p> <p>The Resolution was unanimously passed by the Standing Committee.</p>
--	--	--	---

**Note:**

For more information on parliamentary issues, please visit the Senate Website ( [www.senate.gov.pk](http://www.senate.gov.pk) ) or CPDI-Pakistan’s Website ( [www.cpdi-pakistan.org](http://www.cpdi-pakistan.org) ). You can also make enquiries to a Senator from your constituency/ district. Contact details of Senators and chairmen/members of various parliamentary committees are available on the website of the Senate. CPDI-Pakistan can be contacted by writing to: [info@cpdi-pakistan.org](mailto:info@cpdi-pakistan.org)

## **CPDI-Pakistan**

Centre for Peace and Development Initiatives, Pakistan(CPDI-Pakistan) is an independent, non-partisan and a not-for-profit civil society organization working on issues of peace and development in Pakistan. It was established in 2003. It works in the following five programme areas:

1. Promotion of Peace and Tolerance
2. Rule of Law
3. Transparency and Access to Information
4. Budget Watch
5. Legislative Watch and Democratic Development

**Centre for Peace and Development Initiatives, Pakistan**

105, Park Towers, F-10/3, Islamabad

**Tel:** +92-51-4319430,2108287

**Fax:** +92-51-2101594

**Email:** [info@cpdi-pakistan.org](mailto:info@cpdi-pakistan.org)

**URL:** <http://www.cpdi-pakistan.org>